

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**District of New Mexico**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
V.**Irvin Bitsilly****Judgment in a Criminal Case**

(For Offenses Committed On or After November 1, 1987)

Case Number: 1:09CR03070-001JBUSM Number: **48755-051**Defense Attorney: **Michael Keefe, Appointed**

THE DEFENDANT:

- ☒ pleaded guilty to count(s) **2 of Indictment**
- ☐ pleaded nolo contendere to count(s) which was accepted by the court.
- ☐ after a plea of not guilty was found guilty on count(s)

The defendant is adjudicated guilty of these offenses:

<i>Title and Section Nature of Offense</i>	<i>Offense Ended</i>	<i>Count Number(s)</i>
18 U.S.C. Sexual Abuse; Crime in Indian Country, 18 U.S.C. Sec. 1153 Sec. 2242 (2) and 2246(2)(A)	01/30/2003	2

The defendant is sentenced as provided in pages 2 through 7 of this judgment. The sentence is imposed pursuant to the Sentencing Reform Act of 1984.

- ☐ The defendant has been found not guilty on count .
- ☒ Count **1** is dismissed on the motion of the United States.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the defendant must notify the United States attorney for this district within 30 days of any change of name, residence, or mailing address until all fines, restitution, costs, and special assessments imposed by this judgment are fully paid. If ordered to pay restitution, the defendant must notify the court and United States attorney of material changes in economic circumstances.

February 1, 2011

Date of Imposition of Judgment

/s/ James O. Browning

Signature of Judge

Honorable James O. Browning
United States District Judge

Name and Title of Judge

February 15, 2011

Date Signed

Defendant: **Irvin Bitsilly**
Case Number: **1:09CR03070-001JB**

IMPRISONMENT

The defendant is hereby committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a total term of **60 months**.

The Court has considered and reviewed the factual findings in the two Presentence Investigation Reports ("PSR") and the addendum to the PSR. There not being any objections to the PSR's factual findings, the Court will adopt those as its own. The Court has also considered the sentencing guideline applications in the PSR, and other than the change the Court and the parties made at the hearing that, after a period of incarceration, up to three years of supervised release may be imposed, the Court adopts the sentencing guideline applications in the PSR as its own. The Court has also considered the factors set forth in 18 U.S.C. § 3553(a). Defendant Irvin Bitsilly's offense level is 33, and his criminal history category is I. The guideline imprisonment range is 135 to 168 months. Pursuant to rule 11(c)(1)(C) of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, however, the Court accepts the plea agreement, which includes a specific sentence of 60 months. The United States faced significant hurdles in bringing its case, because of the family relationship between the victim and Bitsilly. Bitsilly was charged with sexual abuse of his step-daughter -- Jane Doe II -- and his daughter by his step-daughter -- Jane Doe I. Bitsilly pled guilty to sexual abuse of Jane Doe II. In the plea agreement, the United States agreed to dismiss Count I of the Indictment, which charged Bitsilly with sexual abuse of Jane Doe I. Jane Doe II does not reside in New Mexico. She is currently in custody in the Denver County jail on an assault with a deadly weapon charge. The United States has had trouble communicating with Jane Doe II because of her status in custody. Jane Doe II was aware of the sentencing hearing, but declined to submit any type of victim impact statement or request any restitution. She also declined to provide any written recitation about the case. Jane Doe II also has a diminished mental capacity, which would have made it difficult for the United States to rely upon her as a witness. Moreover, Bitsilly is 73 and has a serious health condition, as he has been dealing with chronic shingles.

The Court has considered the factors set forth in 18 U.S.C. § 3553(a). The Court notes that Bitsilly engaged in a sexual act with Jane Doe II while she was under the age of 18. The Court has carefully considered the guidelines, but in arriving at its sentence, the Court has taken into account not only the guidelines but other sentencing goals. Specifically, the Court has considered the guideline sentencing range established for the applicable category of offense committed by the applicable category of defendant. The Court does not believe, after carefully considering the factual circumstances of the case, and the arguments of counsel, that the punishment which is set forth in the guidelines is appropriate for this offense. The Court has considered the kinds of sentences and ranges that the guidelines establish, and the Court believes that the sentence of 60 months to which the parties have agreed reflects the seriousness of the offense. Certainly, a longer sentence would emphasize this factor more. The Court believes, however, that a 60-month sentence reflects the seriousness of the offense, and, given Bitsilly's age, a 60-month sentence may be a life sentence.

Given the circumstances of the case, the Court believes that some sentence here is appropriate to promote respect for the law, and the Court is concerned that, given the problems with the United States' case, no sentence might be a real possibility. The Court has previously recognized that, to provide and promote respect for the law, to provide a just punishment, to afford adequate deterrence, and to protect the public, it may take the weaknesses in the United States' case into account to justify a variance and it may be necessary to secure some sentence instead of no sentence. The Court believes that the circumstances present a situation where the problems with the United States' case are appropriate grounds for a variance. Furthermore, because of some of the things the Court will order as part of supervised release, the Court believes that it will be providing Bitsilly with some structure to further protect the public. In conclusion, the Court believes that this sentence fully and effectively reflects each of the factors embodied in 18 U.S.C. 3553(a). And while the Court's task as a trial court is not to come up with a reasonable sentence, but to balance the 18 U.S.C. § 3553(a) factors correctly, see *United States v. Conlan*, 500 F.3d 1167, 1169 (10th Cir. 2007)("[A] district court's job is not to impose a reasonable sentence. Rather, a district court's mandate is to impose a sentence sufficient, but not greater than necessary, to comply with the purposes of section 3553(a)(2).")(citation omitted), the Court believes that this sentence balances the factors in 18 U.S.C. § 3553(a) appropriately and is a more reasonable sentence given that Bitsilly might escape conviction entirely if it were not for the acceptance of the sentence. The Court concludes that this sentence is sufficient without being greater than necessary to comply with the purposes set forth in the Sentencing Reform Act.

☒ The court makes the following recommendations to the Bureau of Prisons:

The Court recommends Safford Federal Correctional Institution, Safford, Arizona, or the closest appropriate Federal Medical Center to the Defendant's family, if eligible.

- ☒ The defendant is remanded to the custody of the United States Marshal.
- ☐ The defendant shall surrender to the United States Marshal for this district:
- ☐ at on
- ☐ as notified by the United States Marshal.
- ☐ The defendant shall surrender for service of sentence at the institution designated by the Bureau of Prisons:
- ☐ before 2 p.m. on
- ☐ as notified by the United States Marshal
- ☐ as notified by the Probation or Pretrial Services Office.

RETURN

I have executed this judgment as follows:

Defendant delivered on _____ to
_____ at _____ with a Certified copy of this judgment.

UNITED STATES MARSHAL

By

DEPUTY UNITED STATES MARSHAL

Defendant: **Irvin Bitsilly**
Case Number: **1:09CR03070-001JB**

SUPERVISED RELEASE

Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall be on supervised release for a term of **3 years**.

The defendant must report to the probation office in the district to which the defendant is released within 72 hours of release from the custody of the Bureau of Prisons.

The defendant shall not commit another federal, state, or local crime.

The defendant shall not unlawfully possess a controlled substance.

The defendant shall refrain from any unlawful use of a controlled substance.

The defendant shall submit to one drug test within 15 days of release from imprisonment and at least two periodic drug tests thereafter, as determined by the court.

- ☐ The above drug testing condition is suspended, based on the court's determination that the defendant poses a low risk of future substance abuse. (Check, if applicable.)
- ☒ The defendant shall not possess a firearm, ammunition, destructive device, or any other dangerous weapon. (Check, if applicable).
- ☒ The defendant shall cooperate in the collection of DNA as directed by the probation officer. (Check, if applicable).
- ☒ The defendant shall register with the state, local, tribal and/or other appropriate sex offender registration agency in the state where the defendant resides, works, or is a student, as directed by the probation officer. (Check, if applicable.)
- ☐ The defendant shall participate in an approved program for domestic violence. (Check, if applicable)

If this judgment imposes a fine or restitution, it is a condition of supervised release that the defendant pay in accordance with the Criminal Monetary Penalties sheet of this judgment.

The defendant must comply with the standard conditions that have been adopted by this court as well as with any additional conditions on the attached page.

STANDARD CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

- 1) the defendant shall not leave the judicial district without the permission of the court or probation officer;
- 2) the defendant shall report to the probation officer and shall submit a truthful and complete written report within the first five days of each month;
- 3) the defendant shall answer truthfully all inquiries by the probation officer and follow the instructions of the probation officer;
- 4) the defendant shall support his or her dependents and meet other family responsibilities;
- 5) the defendant shall work regularly at a lawful occupation, unless excused by the probation officer for schooling, training, or other acceptable reasons;
- 6) the defendant shall notify the probation officer at least ten days prior to any change in residence or employment;
- 7) the defendant shall refrain from excessive use of alcohol and shall not purchase, possess, use, distribute, or administer any controlled substance or any paraphernalia related to any controlled substances, except as prescribed by a physician;
- 8) the defendant shall not frequent places where controlled substances are illegally sold, used, distributed, or administered;
- 9) the defendant shall not associate with any persons engaged in criminal activity, and shall not associate with any person convicted of a felony unless granted permission to do so by the probation officer;
- 10) the defendant shall permit a probation officer to visit him or her at any time at home or elsewhere and shall permit confiscation of any contraband observed in plain view of the probation officer;
- 11) the defendant shall notify the probation officer within seventy-two hours of being arrested or questioned by a law enforcement officer;
- 12) the defendant shall not enter into any agreement to act as an informer or a special agent of a law enforcement agency without the permission of the court; and
- 13) as directed by the probation officer, the defendant shall notify third parties of risks that may be occasioned by the defendant's criminal record or personal history or characteristics and shall permit the probation officer to make such notifications and to confirm the defendant's compliance with such notification requirement;
- 14) the defendant shall immediately register as a sex offender at the Sheriff's Office or designated agency in the permanent or temporary county of residence and in accordance with all registration requirements in local, state and federal laws;
- 15) the defendant shall grant a limited waiver of his/her right of confidentiality and any records of mental health treatment imposed as a consequence of this judgment to allow the treatment provider to provide information to the probation officer and sign all necessary releases to enable the probation officer to monitor the defendant's progress. The probation officer shall disclose the presentence report and/or any previous sex offender or mental health evaluations to the treatment provider;
- 16) the defendant shall not possess any materials including any photographs, images, books, writings, drawings, videos, or video games depicting and/or describing sexually explicit conduct or describing child pornography, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2256(2) or 18 U.S.C. 2256(8);

- 17) the defendant shall submit to search of person, property, vehicles, business, computers, and residence, to be conducted in a reasonable manner and at a reasonable time, for the purpose of detecting sexually explicit material, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2256(2) or 18 U.S.C. 2256(8); and at the direction of the probation officer. The defendant must inform any residents that the premises may be subject to a search;
- 18) the defendant shall immediately undergo a psychosexual evaluation upon release and begin participating in sex offender treatment, consistent with the recommendations of the psychosexual evaluation. Furthermore, the defendant shall submit to clinical polygraph testing and any other specific sex offender testing, as directed by the probation officer;
- 19) the defendant shall participate in a mental health program as directed by the probation officer which may include taking prescribed medication;
- 20) a defendant's use and/or possession of alcohol may be restricted if recommended by the treatment provider as a result of ongoing treatment;
- 21) the defendant shall not go near or enter the premises where the victim resides or is employed, except under circumstances approved in advance and in writing by the probation officer;
- 22) the defendant shall not have any direct or indirect contact or communication with the victim, except under circumstances approved in advance and in writing by the probation officer;

Defendant: **Irvin Bitsilly**
Case Number: **1:09CR03070-001JB**

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

The defendant shall not possess, have under his control, or have access to any firearm, ammunition, explosive device, or other dangerous weapons, as defined by federal, state, or local law.

The defendant must not have contact with children under the age of 18 without prior written permission of the probation officer. He must immediately report unauthorized contact with children to the probation officer.

The defendant is restricted from engaging in an occupation where he has access to children, without prior approval of the probation officer.

The defendant must not loiter within 100 feet of school yards, parks, playgrounds, arcades, or other places used primarily by children under the age of 18.

The defendant must not volunteer for any activities in which he supervises children or adults with mental or physical disabilities.

Defendant: **Irvin Bitsilly**
Case Number: **1:09CR03070-001JB**

CRIMINAL MONETARY PENALTIES

The defendant must pay the following total criminal monetary penalties in accordance with the schedule of payments.

☐ The Court hereby remits the defendant's Special Penalty Assessment; the fee is waived and no payment is required.

Totals:	Assessment	Fine	Restitution
	\$100.00	\$0.00	\$0.00

SCHEDULE OF PAYMENTS

Payments shall be applied in the following order (1) assessment; (2) restitution; (3) fine principal; (4) cost of prosecution; (5) interest; (6) penalties.

Payment of the total fine and other criminal monetary penalties shall be due as follows:

The defendant will receive credit for all payments previously made toward any criminal monetary penalties imposed.

A ☒ In full immediately; or

B ☐ \$ immediately, balance due (see special instructions regarding payment of criminal monetary penalties).

Special instructions regarding the payment of criminal monetary penalties: Criminal monetary penalties are to be made payable by cashier's check, bank or postal money order to the U.S. District Court Clerk, 333 Lomas Blvd. NW, Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102 unless otherwise noted by the court. Payments must include defendant's name, current address, case number and type of payment.

The Mandatory Victim Restitution Act of 1996 is applicable to this case. However, no restitution will be ordered at this time. The Court notes it has up to 90 days after the date of sentencing to determine the full extent of each victims losses, pursuant to U.S.C. Sec. 3664(d)(5).

Unless the court has expressly ordered otherwise in the special instructions above, if this judgment imposes a period of imprisonment, payment of criminal monetary penalties shall be due during the period of imprisonment. All criminal monetary penalty payments, except those payments made through the Bureau of Prisons' Inmate Financial Responsibility Program, are to be made as directed by the court, the probation officer, or the United States attorney.